Ethnic Conflict and Minority Rights in Eastern Europe
2013 World View Spring Seminar

Dr. Robert M Jenkins
Director, UNC Center for Slavic, Eurasian, & East European Studies
Overview of Presentation

• Preliminary Questions: ethnicity, nationalism, violence
• Ethno-national violence in Yugoslavia: background, war, intervention, post-violence outcomes
• Conclusions
What is an Ethnic Group?

• Concept somewhat “plastic”
• Broad definition: Collective with common social characteristics: culture, language, religion, race, tribe, or nation origin
• Often given in categorical manner – census grouping
• Variable sense of shared identity – expressed in symbols, myths, memories
What are Nation and Nationality?

- Nation distinguished from ethnic group by political nature of collective/community – i.e., claim for political autonomy or statehood
- Opposing conceptions: constructed/founding vs. natural/always existing
- Nation and nationality product of modern state formation – national language, national education system, national military service
- Implies clearly demarcated territory & unified administration
What is Nationalism?

• Nationalism is rhetoric and political action demarcating political community
• Closely associated with right to self-determination, political legitimacy based upon rule by “the people”
• Ideal political legitimacy: boundaries of people (ethnic group) coterminous with boundaries of political administration
• Ernest Gellner – combination of state formation and creation of “high cultures” (e.g., modern literature) produces nationalism
State-Building Framework

State – set of political organizations

• Maintaining territorial control (external defense, internal order, resource extraction)
• Recognized position in international state system (claim to sovereign control)
• Representing a political community living in territory (criteria of membership)
What is Nationalist Violence?

• Use of force to cause bodily harm or direct threat of such force
• Violence is qualitatively distinct form of conflict
• Nationalist violence usually clustered within larger cycles of nationalist contention; armed conflict typically occurs later stages of mobilization cycle
What Leads to Nationalist Violence?

• Collapse of central authority
• Security dilemma: perceived threat triggers counter moves & preemptive attack
• Credible commitments – inability of ethnicized state leaders to commit to protect minorities
• Information asymmetry in face of high levels of ethnic solidarity
• Small disciplined conflict groups organized to carry out violence
• Cultural construction of fear
Violent Ethnic Conflicts in Europe

- Basque Country
- Cyprus
- Northern Ireland
- Post-communist – former Soviet Union & Yugoslavia
- Share mobilized ethno-national groups with territorial disputes
Background to Nationalist Violence in Former Yugoslavia

• Long-term economic crisis & decentralization weakened central state
• Past history of inter-group violence
• Security dilemma for minorities in new states
• Political leadership used ethno-nationalism for mobilization
• Presence of para-military and military formations
• External action/inaction: lack of will & capacity; recognition of constituent republics/nations
Violent Conflicts in former Yugoslavia

• Croatia, 1991-1995
• Bosnia-Herzegovina, 1992-1995
• Kosovo, 1989-???
• Macedonia, 2001
Shared background in Communist Yugoslavia

- Communist-led anti-fascist victory of Partisans – Brotherhood & Unity
- Communist monopoly of power & ideology
- Decentralized political & economic power
- Ethnic heterogeneity
- Persistent nationalist challenges

Marshall Tito
Federalism & Ethnicity, 1991
Breakup of Yugoslavia

- Late 1980s Slovenian leaders press for autonomy
- 1989 Serbia revokes autonomy of Kosovo
- 1990 Breakup of League of Communists leads to multi-party elections in republics
- Nationalist parties victorious in Slovenia, Croatia, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Serbia
- June 1991 – Slovenia and Croatia declare independence
Croatian Conflict, 1991-95

- Conflict between Serb minority and Croatian majority
- 1992, UN peacekeeping force deployed
- 1995 military victory of Croatian forces
- Short international supervision of final territorial integration

Destruction of Vukovar
Bosnia-Herzegovina, 1992-95

• 3-sided ethnic conflict: Serbs, Croats, & Bosniaks (Muslims)
• UN humanitarian & “peacekeeping” efforts highlight international weakness
• 1995 Croatian-Bosniak military alliance & NATO bombing campaign ended war
• Dayton peace agreement brought international post-conflict intervention but also cemented ethnic power

Parliament building in Sarajevo, 1992
Kosovo, 1989-???

- 1989, Serbia revoked autonomy
- 1990s Serbian repression & ethnic Albanian nonviolence
- 1998-99 Kosovo Liberation Army (Albanian) insurgency & Serbian counter-insurgency
- 1999, NATO intervention led to international administration
- 2008, Kosovo declaration of independence

Kosovo Liberation Army
Macedonia, 2001

- Ethnic Albanian insurgency against Macedonian government
- Limited conflict: territory, period, casualties
- Mediation by EU & US produced political compromise

Macedonian soldier in Tetovo
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Bosnia</th>
<th>Croatia</th>
<th>Kosovo</th>
<th>Macedonia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Casualties &amp; damage</strong></td>
<td>100,000 dead</td>
<td>20,000 dead</td>
<td>12,000 dead NATO produced casualties: 500-600</td>
<td>150 dead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Refugees &amp; Internally Displaced Persons</strong></td>
<td>1.2 million refugees 1.3 IDPs</td>
<td>525,000 refugees 582,000 IDPs</td>
<td>Pre-Mar 1999: 100,000 refugees; 260,000 IDPs Mar-Jun 1999: 800,000 refugees Post-Jun 1999: 230,000 IDPs</td>
<td>150,000 refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Territorial conflict</strong></td>
<td>Military occupation &amp; state building</td>
<td>Military occupation &amp; state building</td>
<td>Insurgency &amp; air campaign</td>
<td>Insurgency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Internal actors involved</strong></td>
<td>1 rump state &amp; 2 para-states</td>
<td>1 state &amp; 1 para-state</td>
<td>1 state &amp; 1 insurgency</td>
<td>1 state &amp; 1 insurgency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summary</strong></td>
<td>Deadly &amp; disruptive conflict with three years of failed international response Political &amp; military institutionalization of conflict cemented by peace accord</td>
<td>Short intense conflict with UN peace keeping &amp; territorial stalemate Croatian military victories led to final shape of settlement - negotiated territorial integration</td>
<td>Increasing insurgency built on long-term hostility &amp; ended by international military intervention International military &amp; civilian administration established Contested declaration of independence</td>
<td>Short insurgency with strong international response led to brokered political agreement among ethnic political parties</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Structures of Peace Agreements

- International peacemaking (Bosnia & Kosovo) and mediation (all conflicts)
- Bosnia, Dayton Agreement: Strong military intervention (IFOR/SFOR/EUFOR); Fragmented civilian intervention – Elections priority (OSCE), human rights (OSCE), return of displaced (UNHCR), police monitoring (UN/EU), civilian coordination (OHR); State Constitution
- Croatia, Erdut Agreement: UN Transitional Administration for Danube Region integrating military and civilian roles
- Kosovo, UN SC Resolution 1244: Strong military intervention (KFOR); Civilian administration (UN), with additional roles for OSCE & EU
- Macedonia, Ohrid Agreement: political agreement requiring Constitutional & legislative changes, monitored by EU, OSCE, & others; weapons collection organized by NATO
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bosnia</th>
<th>Croatia</th>
<th>Kosovo</th>
<th>Macedonia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Name</strong></td>
<td>General Framework Agreement for Peace (Dayton)</td>
<td>Basic Agreement (Erdut)</td>
<td>Framework Agreement (Ohrid)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Key Items</strong></td>
<td>• Military mission</td>
<td>• UN transitional administration</td>
<td>• Cessation of hostilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Military disengagement</td>
<td>• Return of refugees IDPs</td>
<td>• Revised law on local self-government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Confidence building</td>
<td>• Local elections</td>
<td>• Change in appointment of police chiefs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• State constitution</td>
<td>• Human rights</td>
<td>• Public administration representation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Elections</td>
<td>• Policing</td>
<td>• Constitutional revision – civic state, minority vote</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Human Rights</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Hold donors conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Return of Refugees &amp; IDPs</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Census</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• International Police Supervision</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Office of High Representative</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Timetables</strong></td>
<td>Military mission (1 year, but later renewed)</td>
<td>Mission (1 year; renewable 1 year)</td>
<td>Constitutional amendments, Law on local self-government: within 45 days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Demilitarization (up to 120 days)</td>
<td>Elections (30 days before end of mission)</td>
<td>Police hiring: Jul. 2002, 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Elections (within 9 months)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Legacies of Ethnic Conflict

- **BiH:** highly ethnicized political environment; institutionalized power sharing; political parties appeal to identity issues
- **Croatia:** ethnic Croat political dominance; small minority of Serbs represented by single political party, participating in coalition governments; minority rights implemented 2000-01
- **Kosovo:** small minorities of Serbs & other groups; institutionalized representation structured by international community; Serbs largely boycott Kosovo politics
- **Macedonia:** ethnic identity structures politics; inter-ethnic party coalitions
## Post-Violence Ethnic Politics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Bosnia</th>
<th>Croatia</th>
<th>Kosovo</th>
<th>Macedonia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Constitutional structure</strong></td>
<td>State level created by Dayton Agreement</td>
<td>No changes brought by agreement</td>
<td>Constitution passed by Kosovo Assembly after Declaration of Independence</td>
<td>Ohrid Agreement proposed changes to enhance minority rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Institutional structure</strong></td>
<td>Fragmented: 2 Entities: Republika Srpska &amp; Federation of BiH; FBiH – 10 cantons</td>
<td>Centralized state</td>
<td>Single parliament with local governments Parallel Serb structures in north</td>
<td>Centralized state with more devolved local powers post-Ohrid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Political parties</strong></td>
<td>Ethnic based, with war-time parties still strong among Bosniaks &amp; Croats Inter-ethnic cooperation limited to formal power-sharing</td>
<td>Wartime party still strong, less nationalist; single, small Serb party participates in government coalitions</td>
<td>Competition among both ethnic Albanian and Serbian parties; Serbs in north boycott Kosovo politics</td>
<td>Competition between parties within ethnic groups; coalitions across groups</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Impact of War on Bosnia’s Ethnicity
Post-War Ethnic Map of Kosovo
Post-Violence International Intervention Compared

- BiH: complex dynamic changing over time – early military success brought peace; elections secured nationalist power & led to strengthening of civilian authority (Bonn Powers); heavy intervention to implement property law, some elements of central state; resistance to return process & state building; Europeanization limited success

- Croatia: successful transitional authority produced peaceful integration of territory; minority rights regime implemented in Danube; with political change, minority rights adopted throughout state; Europeanization adopted; EU membership nearly complete
Intervention Compared – cont.

- Kosovo: military intervention secured peace, with exception of Mar 2004 violence; civilian administration established local political institutions but unable to maintain Serb participation; institutional capacity still in development; political process toward status settlement failed, exposing mixed goals of international actors; large EU states & US promoted independence as alternative but unrecognized by Serbia, Russia, and some EU members; EULEX rule of law mission as follow-on to UN; status contested

- Macedonia: international pressure brought negotiated political settlement; limited weapons collection success; Constitutional & legal changes increased minority rights; Europeanization process slow to evolve; EU candidate country but little movement
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intervention Outcomes</th>
<th>Bosnia</th>
<th>Croatia</th>
<th>Kosovo</th>
<th>Macedonia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peace</td>
<td>Peace</td>
<td>Peace, except Mar 2004</td>
<td>Peace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Property restitution</td>
<td>Reintegration of territory</td>
<td>Development of local political institutions</td>
<td>Constitutional &amp; legal revisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Limited return of displaced</td>
<td>Limited return outside Danube</td>
<td>State building slowly developing capacity</td>
<td>EU Candidacy stalled by Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Limited state building</td>
<td>Danube</td>
<td>Failed status negotiations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Failed constitutional changes</td>
<td>Minority rights regime</td>
<td>Declaration of independence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Resistance to international authority</td>
<td>adopted</td>
<td>Uncertain EU future</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Property restitution
- Limited return of displaced
- Limited state building
- Failed constitutional changes
- Resistance to international authority
- Peace
- Reintegration of territory
- Limited return outside Danube
- Danube
- Minority rights regime
- EU Candidacy & Negotiations
- Declaration of independence
- Uncertain EU future
- EU Candidacy stalled by Greece
Summary

• Peace successful due to strong military intervention and development of regional approach
• Cooperation of local authorities most important factor ensuring success – Croatia, Macedonia
• Resistance to return of displaced remains strong throughout region, particularly to areas where ethnic control has changed – Bosnia, Croatia, Kosovo
• Resistance can be overcome through coordinated administrative authority, but requires political will that is hard to mobilize -- Bosnia
• State building does not bring quick results, can face local opposition – Bosnia, Kosovo
Conclusions

• Ethno-nationalist violence in former Yugoslavia result of breakdown of state & nationalist mobilization by political leaders
• End of war required political will by parties to violence and intervention by international actors
• Result of major violence been ethnic segregation and challenges for new states
• Post-violence EU strategy of Stabilization and Association Process yielded mixed results